



THE LEXICAL ERRORS MADE BY THE EIGHTH GRADERS OF SMP PGRI 1 PALEMBANG IN TRANSLATING NARRATIVE TEXT ENTITLED "THE FOX AND THE GRAPES" FROM ENGLISH INTO INDONESIAN

Mastoni¹, Tahrur², Mulyadi³

^{1,2,3} English Education Department, Universitas PGRI Palembang, Indonesia
E-mail: denganmastoni@gmail.com

Accepted :

March 10, 2024

Published :

June 10, 2024

Corresponding Author:

Mastoni

Email Corresponding :

denganmastoni@gmail.com

ABSTRACT

The objective of this research aims to know the types, the causes of lexical error found in translating narrative text, and the steps of the implication theory for teaching English as a foreign language. This research used a descriptive qualitative approach with the strategy of Case Study. This research used a descriptive qualitative approach with the strategy of Case Study in which analyzing by describing the lexical errors that student produces in translating narrative text from English into Indonesian. The source of data is the narrative text entitled "The Fox and the Grapes". The data were collected by using review book and interview. Based on the research, the researcher found The errors included Prefix type (5 errors), Misselection (2 errors), Using wrong near-synonym (1 error), semantically determined word selection (28 error). Errors committed due to the learner's inability to recall, errors caused by confusion between formally similar items. The theoretical implication for language teaching. The finding of this research hopefully can give a contribution to the English teaching and learning process.

Keywords: Translation, Error, Lexical Error, Teaching

1. INTRODUCTION

People must refresh their knowledge about this universe and its contents in order to try to develop the world. People can improve their knowledge of other countries by using a variety of knowledge sources. Books are the most easily accessible source. However, if the books are written in a foreign language, it is not possible to get significant information from them. Providing translated books is the most efficient technique to aid readers in comprehending the content of the books. Therefore, in order to increase knowledge by disseminating the information found in foreign books, translation skills are required.

The translation is the replacement of textual material written in one language by

equal written material in another language (Catford, 1974). In other words, during the translating process, a translator is obligated to look for the most comparable versions of written materials from the source language (SL) to the target language (TL). For this reason, to replicate the message in the target language originates from the source language, a translator needs to understand the meaning of the message before re-writing the message in the target language. To understand the message, it is suggested that a translator is required to possess reading skills because through reading, people can get more knowledge and information from books, magazines, newspapers, and others.

Similarly, Rasmieh Al-Amer et. al (2015) claimed that translation was the

Vol 7, No 2 (2024): ESTEEM

process of interpretation. Therefore, translation is not simply a direct transfer of a message from SL to TL, but a systematic and accurate capture of the complete meaning of the spoken language. The process of translation is defined as the delivery of messages from SL into TL.

Learners typically encounter challenges when translating. Errors discovered in their translation results can be used to examine the challenges. Misunderstandings in the formulation of linguistic components lead to errors. Lexical mistakes are those in which a word's form or meaning deviates from the target language (TL) (Llach, 2011). Furthermore, El-Farahaty (2016) pointed out that the meanings and purposes of the lexical words may vary depending on the culture that produced them. The lexical items may have diverse roles and meanings as a result of cultural variations.

Based on his latest research, Richard (1985) confirmed that in studying a language, a distinction is usually drawn between grammar and what is called lexical. Then, Dinnen (1980) wrote that lexical has grammatical forms and thus meaningful. It is not enough just to combine words but it should also be considered whether it is meaningful or not. In reaching the purpose, one should follow the system.

According to James (1998), there are two classifications of lexical errors: formal and semantic. Formal errors of lexis include morphology related errors (children for children) (freshman for freshers), and semantic errors in lexis which deal with the meanings that the learners wish to convey (e.g. smell for scent and nephew for niece). Additionally, Meara (cited in Gass & Selinker, 2001) had observed that lexical errors outnumbered grammatical errors by a three to one ratio in a particular corpus. These arguments were supported by Gass that the native speakers found lexical errors tended to

disrupt communication more than grammatical errors did.

The narrative text is a kind of text that tells the reader about the past event in which the purpose is amusing or entertaining the reader. Narrative text as one of the kinds of texts that were taught in school. The writing of narrative text involves the writing of the past time, like fable, myth, legend, fairy tale. The narrative text is a type of text which provides proverb, phrase, synonym, antonym, and different cultural meaning in a sentence. The text contains a feeling expression, amusing things, or advice as a way to communicate. During the learning process, teachers need to devise an appropriate strategy. According to Fulwiler (2002), the narrative text refers to the general term for a story long or short; of the past, present, or future; factual or imagined; told for any purpose, and with or without much detail. This may mean writing a narrative may imply that the writers tell some stories about something that has happened or they have witnessed in their life. This experience should be one that has meaning for the writers, or something the writers would be willing to explore in an attempt to find meanings.

Also, Peter Knapp (2005) clarified that narrative is one of the most popular kinds of text to be read by readers, even though sometimes it was not easily understood compared to all other genres. Narrative writing is the type that can tell a story whether it is fictional or not, and it is supposed to include the writing about events that happen and time sequence.

2. LITERATURE REVIEW

Concept of Translation

According to Nida and Taber (1982), translation encompasses the reproduction of the language receptor into the most natural comparable messages of the SL. First, the equivalence is in terms of meaning and

Vol 7, No 2 (2024): ESTEEM

second, in terms of style. Newmark (1981) pointed out that translation is an art consisting of the attempt to replace a written message and/or statement in one language by the same message and/or statement in another language. Translation has its excitement and interest. Newmark (1981) pointed out that translation is an art consisting of the attempt to replace a written message and/or statement in one language by the same message and/or statement in another language. Translation has its excitement and interest. What is more, McGuire in Suryawinata (2003) clarified that translation is the representation of a source language (SL) into the target language (TL) on condition that the surface meaning of the two will be equivalent and the structure of the SL will be preserved as closely as possible without distorting the TL structure. All the above statements about translation have the same ideas, so it can be concluded that translation is a process of replacing or transferring messages, thoughts, ideas, meaning, or information from the source language to the target language. The main point in the translation is that a translator may not change the meaning of the message of the original text. The translation involves two languages where the former is from the source text while the latter is the output of the target text which is the second language of the text. Therefore, to obtain a translation of quality, the output has to produce a similar work or renders a similar meaning to the one in the source text.

Process Of Translation

Newmark (1988: 22) asserted that the process of translation operates at four levels, namely: source text level, referential level, cohesive level, and level of naturalness.

1. Textual level

At this level, the translator alters the syntactic structures of the source text into corresponding structures in the target text.

2. Referential level

This is where the translator works primarily with the message (or information) or semantics of the text.

3. Cohesive level

This level connects the textual and the referential levels and concerns with the structure/format of the text and information.

4. Level of naturalness

This level concentrates on the composition of the target text, after having deconstructed the source text. Some things may just seem unnatural in the target language and entangle matters since naturalness is dictated by situations.

Definition Of Error

According to Dulay, Burt & Krashen (1982) defined that errors are the flawed side of learner speech or writing. They are those parts of conversation or composition that deviate from some selected norm of mature language performance. Krashen (1982) stated that errors are those parts of conversation or composition that deviate from some selected norm of mature language performance. Errors caused by the interference of the learner's mother tongue. People cannot learn a language without first systematically committing errors. Corder (1973) defined that error as branches of the code. A learner makes errors because of a lack of knowledge of the formation rules of the language being learned and therefore the meaning of phrase or sentences produced is unacceptable. From the expert above the writer can conclude that the appearance of such errors can be detected. It means that the errors arise because each learner has a different motivation, social background, and intelligence. It has a relationship with the learner's language competence. In learning a second language, some errors appear because the learners have

Vol 7, No 2 (2024): ESTEEM

not yet understood the grammar of the second language.

The Lexical Errors

According to Llach (2011), a lexical error is a deviation in the form and/or meaning of a TL lexical word. The deviations of forms include orthographic or phonological deviations within the limits of single words, and also ignorance of syntactical restrictions which result in false collocations, for example. Meaning deviations appear when lexical items are used in contexts where they are attributed to another meaning or where they violate semantic restrictions; in Berkoff's words (1981) when there is the 'incorrect choice of lexical items', or also when some semantic feature is not considered. Besides, lexical error reflects the bad sign of writing skills in the part of the learner (Llach, 2011). In addition, Richard (1985) defined that in studying a language, a distinction is usually drawn between grammar and what is called lexical. Then, Dinnen (1980) wrote that lexical has grammatical forms and thus meaningful. It is not enough just to combine words but it should also be considered whether it is meaningful or not. In reaching the purpose, one should follow the system.

Similarly, James (1998) classified that lexical errors into two types: formal and semantic. Formal errors of lexis include morphology related errors (children for children) (freshman for freshers) and semantic errors in lexis deal with the meanings the learners wish to convey (e.g. smell for scent and nephew for niece), and Meara (cited in Gass&Selinker, 2001) observed that lexical errors outnumbered grammatical errors by a three to one ratio in a particular corpus. Gass supported Meara's arguments that the native speakers usually found lexical errors blocking communication more than grammatical errors did.

Similarly, Llach (2011) following James (1998) wrote some pages to the discussion of

lexical errors and offered a taxonomy that discussed the distinction between form- and content-oriented lexical errors. Among the formal errors of lexis, James distinguished the following:

1. Formal misselection in which two existing target language words are confused because of formal similarity.
2. Misformations which involve the creation of a non-existing L2 word. Three main types of misformations are considered: borrowing, coinage, and calque.
3. Distortions originating from letter omission, overinclusion (addition), misselection, misordering, and blending.

Theory of Teaching

Simaibang (2016) clarified that the teaching framework needs to be designed in a way that it offers procedures, methods, and activities to be adopted in the teaching and learning processes to improve English language proficiency which is described as follows:

1. Improvement of listening, speaking, reading, and writing skills.
2. ELT appropriate teaching materials and textbooks.
3. Adoption of suitable teachers' role in the foreign teaching situation.
4. Suitable teaching approaches for adult language learners.
5. Learners need analysis.

The teacher should have training in the teaching method of English to enable them to be able to provide an approach and clear lesson plans that would become a reference in presenting the teaching materials in the instruction.

Danielson (2007) stated that aspects of a teacher's responsibilities that have been

Vol 7, No 2 (2024): ESTEEM

documented through empirical studies and theoretical research as promoting improved student learning. Although they are not the only possible description of practice, these responsibilities seek to define what teachers should know and be able to do in the exercise of their profession.

3. METHOD

In order to analyze and describe the lexical errors that students make when translating narrative texts from English into Indonesian, this research used a descriptive qualitative methodology using the Case Study method. The narrative text "The Fox and the Grapes" serves as the data source. Students gather the data and convert it into Indonesian. Lexical errors were the basis for the writer's error classification since they were simpler to identify and categorize.

4. FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION**FINDINGS**

The findings as presented below are obtained from a triangulation study that included narrative text and book review.

Errors Found in the Target Language S1

It can be seen from the text translation S1 above, from 5 categories of lexical errors, 1 category of errors was found.

a. Semantically determined word selection

Among 6 sentences, the writer found three semantically determined word selection errors described as follows:

SL: turned up his nose, them, they're

TL: mengangkathidungnya, mereka

The word "turned up his nose, them, they're" is translated into "mengangkathidungnya, mereka". This translation is not suitable with the tenses used. To make it grammatically acceptable, the word "turned up his nose,

them, they're" should have been translated into "melihatkeatas, angguritu".

Errors found in the Target Language S2

It can be seen from the text translation S2 above, from 5 categories of lexical errors, 2 categories of error were found.

a. Using Wrong near Synonym

Among the 6 sentences, the writer found one using wrong near-synonym error described as follows:

SL: reach

TL: mencapai

The word "reach" is translated into "mencapai". This translation is not suitable for the tenses used. To make it grammatically acceptable, the word "reach" should have been translated into "menjangkau".

b. Semantically Determined Word Selection

Among 6 sentences, the writer found two semantically determined word selection errors described as follows:

SL: them, they're

TL: mereka

The word "them, they're" is translated into "mereka". This translation is not suitable for the tenses used. To make it grammatically acceptable, the word "them, they're" should have been translated into "anggur itu".

Errors Found in the Target Language S3

As can be seen from the text translation S3 above, from 5 categories of lexical errors, 1 category of error was found.

a. Semantically determined word selection

Among the 6 sentences, the writer found three semantically determined word selection error described as follows:

SL: turned up his nose, them, they're

TL: mengangkathidungnya, mereka, mereka

Vol 7, No 2 (2024): ESTEEM

The word “turned up his nose, them, they’re” is translated into “mengangkathidungnya, mereka, mereka”. This translation is not suitable with the tenses used. To make it grammatically acceptable, the word “turned up his nose, them, they’re” should have been translated into “melihat keatas, buah itu”.

Errors Found in the Target Language S4

As can be seen from the text translation S6 above, from 5 categories of lexical errors, 2 categories of error were found.

a. Misselection

Among the 6 sentences, the writer found one misselection error described as follows:

SL: Again

TL: Lagi

The word “Again” is translated into “Lagi”. This translation is not suitable for the tenses used. To make it grammatically acceptable, the word “Again” should have been translated into “Sekalilagi”.

b. Semantically determined word selection

Among the 6 sentences, the writer found two semantically determined word selection error described as follows:

SL: them, they’re

TL: mereka

The word “them, they’re” is translated into “mereka”. This translation is not suitable for the tenses used. To make it grammatically acceptable, the word “them, they’re” should have been translated into “angguritu”.

Errors Found in the Target Language S5

As can be seen from the text translation S12 above, from 5 categories of lexical errors, 1 category of error were found.

a. Semantically Determined Word Selection

Among the 6 sentences, the writer found three semantically determined word selection error described as follows:

SL: took, them, they’re

TL: mengambil, mereka

The word “took, them, they’re” is translated into “mengambil, mereka”. This translation is not suitable with the tenses used. To make it grammatically acceptable, the word “took, them, they’re” should have been translated into “mundur, angguritu”.

Errors in Language Learning and Use: Exploring error analysis by James (1998). The Lexical errors were of two topics or items, including (1) Formal error, (2) Semantic error. In Other Words, A Course Book On Translation by Baker (1992) lists eight strategies, which have been used by professional translators, to cope with the problematic issues while doing a translation task: translation by a more general word, translation by a more neutral/less expressive word, the purpose of the translation, translation by paraphrase using a related word, translation by paraphrase using unrelated words, translation by omission, and translation by illustration.

English Language Teaching In A Foreign Situation by Simaibang (2017). Teaching language is a process, an action, the way to teach, or to transfer knowledge. Nowadays, teaching language means helping students to learn individually and it is known as a self study in which teacher only gives motivation and stimulation. Language learning has a role as a process of activity that has the responsibility in preparing the students to become “speech community members” that can face the changing of everything in the globalization era.

Book Review

The writer used some books to analyze this research. For example, they are:

Vol 7, No 2 (2024): ESTEEM

1. Errors in Language Learning and Use: Exploring error analysis by James (1998). The Lexical errors were of two topics or items, including (1) Formal error, (2) Semantic error.

2. In Other Words, A Course Book On Translation by Baker (1992) lists eight strategies, which have been used by professional translators, to cope with the problematic issues while doing a translation task: translation by a more general word, translation by a more neutral/less expressive word, the purpose of the translation, translation by paraphrase using a related word, translation by paraphrase using unrelated words, translation by omission, and translation by illustration.

3. English Language Teaching In A Foreign Situation by Simaibang (2017). Teaching language is a process, an action, the way to teach, or to transfer knowledge. Nowadays, teaching language means helping students to learn individually and it is known as a self study in which teacher only gives motivation and stimulation. Language learning has a role as a process of activity that has the responsibility in preparing the students to become "speech community members" that can face the changing of everything in the globalization era.

Interview

To ensure the validity or trustworthiness of the writer's analysis of data, the writer interviewed one of the English teachers in State High School 5 of Prabumulih. The writer asked some questions from the formulation of the problems for him and he answered the questions briefly.

From the interview, the first question is what are the types of lexical errors found in translating narrative text entitled "The Fox and the Grapes" from English into Indonesian by students? He said that according to his experience in translating from English into Indonesian or Indonesian into English,

usually the wrong words often occur in students' translations, this is because students do not understand the context of the source language text and choose the meaning of words that are too literal so that the resulting text translation is still ambiguous.

The second question is what are the causes of lexical errors found in translating narrative text entitled "The Fox and the Grapes" from English into Indonesian by students? According to him, It seems that student's translation used free translation without considering the actual meaning of the sentences and lexical rules. This is because students are less likely to use referral sources such as dictionaries and translator machines so that they translate free source language texts that are oriented towards the target language, so the resulting text translates into an error of improper meaning.

The third question is what is the theoretical implication for language teaching? According to him, the implication for language teaching can give a contribution to the English teaching and learning process. The translation is one of the subjects taught in the English Language Teaching Department. In translation subjects, the students can use referral sources such as dictionaries and translator machines but the result must check it again.

DISCUSSION

This research is the same as Siahaan that studies about Lexical Errors. The study is written by Siahaan (2018), this study is entitled "Lexical Errors in Writing English Paragraph Made by the First Semester Students of STT ABDI SABDA Medan: A Case Study".

There are 104 errors made by the students which are often types of lexical errors. They are: 2 suffixes (1,9%), 3 consonants based (2,9%), 44 borrowings (42,3%), 8 omissions (7,7%), 14 overinclusions (13,5%), 10 misselections (9,6%), 1 misordering (0,1%),

Vol 7, No 2 (2024): ESTEEM

3 using a superonym for a hyponym (2,9%), 5 using a wrong near-synonym (4,8%) and 14 semantically determined word selection (13,5%). which are found on students working in writing paragraph.

The findings of this study's error analysis demonstrate that students are still making a lot of mistakes. It appears that the disparity in writing styles between Indonesian and English is the cause of pupils' failure. Whereas Bahasa Indonesia uses "Diterangkan – Menerangkan (D-M)" or "Headword-Modifier," English uses "Menerangkan-Diterangkan (M-D)" or "Modifier-Headword." Students who translate "the fox turned up his nose" into "rubah mengangkat hidungnya" likewise experience this. The correct sentence is "rubah itu melihat keatas." Lexically, the sentence is incorrect.

CONCLUSION

Based on the findings of the research as presented earlier, three conclusions are being reached as follows:

1. There were 36 lexical errors found in the six translated texts of narrative text. The errors included Prefix type (5 errors), Misselection (2 errors), Using wrong near-synonym (1 error), semantically determined word selection (28 error).
2. Errors committed due to the learner's inability to recall, errors caused by confusion between formally similar items, errors committed due to insufficient knowledge of target language items, sometimes, the second language learners are unable to differentiate various grammatical functions of some items that look similar, lexical errors committed due to confusion between related items.
3. The theoretical implication for language teaching. The finding of this research hopefully can give a contribution to the English teaching and learning process. Translation is one of the subjects thought in the English Language Teaching Department. Translation subject is presented into two-part,

English-Indonesian Translation, and Indonesian English Translation.

5. REFERENCES

- Al-Amer, Rasmieh et. al, (2015). Language translation challenges with Arabic speakers participating in qualitative research studies. *International Journal of Nursing Studies*.
- Catford, J. C. (1965). *A Linguistic Theory of Translation: An Essay to Applied Linguistics*. London: Oxford University Press.
- Berkoff, N.A. (1981) Error analysis revisited. In G. Nickel and D. Nehls (eds) *Error Analysis, Contrastive Linguistics and Second Language Learning. Papers from the 6th International Congress of Applied Linguistics* (pp. 5_17). Lund 1981. Heidelberg: Groos.
- Danielson, C. (2007). *Electronic Forms and Rubrics for Enhancing Professional Practice: A Framework for Teaching*.
- Dulay, Heidi, Burt, Marina, Krashen, and Stephen. (1982). *Language Two*. Oxford: Oxford University Press. *Encyclopedia of Translation Studies*. (2nded.). New York: Routledge.
- Llach, Maria. (2011). *Lexical Errors and Accuracy in Foreign Language Writing*. Bristol: The MPG Books Group.
- Newmark, P. (1981). *Approaches to Translation*. Oxford: Pergamon.
- Newmark, P. (1988). *A Textbook of Translation*. New York and London: Prentice Hall.
- Nida, E.A. & Taber, C. R. (1964). *Towards a Science of Translating: with Special Reference to Principles and Procedures involved in Bible Translating*. Leiden: E. J. Brill.
- Simaibang, Baginda. (2016). *English Language Teaching In A Foreign Situation*. Palembang: Citrabooks.